

Analytical Knowledge of Result (*Atthapaṭisambhidā*)

H. M. Mahinda Herath

The analytical knowledge of result (*atthapaṭisambhidā*) is the first knowledge of the fourfold analytical knowledge. It is the knowledge that comprehends 'result' (*attha*) analytically. In the first instance, it is pre-eminently important to explain what *attha* is and what *attha* is in the scope of *atthapaṭisambhidā* before discussing the subject matter of the analytical knowledge of result (*atthapaṭisambhidā*).

Meanings of 'Attha'

Generally, the term '*attha*' has a wide range of meanings. It is formed from different roots bearing different meanings. '*Attha*' can be a noun, an adjective, a verb or an indeclinable word (*nipāta*). Accordingly, '*attha*' embraces a wide range of implications used diversely in different contexts of the Pāli literature.

'Attha' as a Noun

As a noun, '*attha*' is formed from four roots.

1. *ara* (Sk:) meaning 'to go' (*gatiya*)
2. *√asa* (Sk: *√asa*) meaning 'to go, to shine and to take' (*gatiya dity-ādānesu ca*),
3. *√attha* (Sk: *√artha*) meaning 'to beg' (*yācamāya*),
4. *asu* (Sk: *asu*) meaning 'to throw' (*khepe*).

As a verb and indeclinable, '*attha*' is formed from the root *asa* (Sk: *asa*) meaning 'to be, to exist' (*bhuvī*). With the root *ara*, '*attha*' is formed by a combination of *ara* and the noun-forming suffix '*tha*'.¹ According to the modern method of assimilation, when '*tha*' is added to the root *ara*, the last vowel 'a' of *ara* must be elided and the consonant 'r' of *√ara* is assimilated to 'th' because it is weaker than 'th' of '*tha*'. Then the double consonant 'rth' is changed into 'th' since there is no such double consonant in Pāli. Hence, there comes the word '*attha*'.

Though 'attha' is formed with the single root √ara and the only suffix 'tha', it has several meanings.

- 1 'Meaning or connotation' (*abhidheyya*),
 "Sakhittena bhāsītassa eva vitthārena atthaṃ ājānāmi."
 "I understand the meaning of what is said in brief with details"
- 2 'Explanation or commentary' (*ahakathā*),
 "Attha ca dunnīto"²
 The explanation is wrongly applied.
- 3 Something advantageous or need (*payojana*),
 "Attha me gahapati hiraññasuvaṇṇena."
 Oh Householder,³ I am in need of gold coin.
- 4 Prosperity (*vuddhi* or *vaḍḍhi*), "Hoti silavata attha..."⁴
 Prosperity accrues to the virtuous,
 "...Attha atthe anatthe ca, ubhayassa hoti kovidō."⁵
 ...Then, he is skilled both in prosperity and poverty.
- 5 Wealth or property (*dhana*),
 "Atthañca disvā parivārayanti..."⁶
 Having seen the wealth, they encompass it...
- 6 Benefit or welfare (*hita*),
 "Ubhinnamattha carati..."⁷
 He acts for the benefit of both.
- 7 Practical reason, fact and purpose (*kāraṇa*),
 "...Atthe jāte ca paṇḍitanti"⁸
 When a practical reason arises, (they need) a wise man;
 "Devatā Bhagavato eta attha ārocesuṃ"⁹
 The deities told the fact to the Blessed One);
 "Kenatthena idhāgato"¹⁰
 For what purpose, did you come here?.
- 8 Effect or result (*phala*),
 "Hetuphale nāṇaṃ atthapaṭisambhidā"¹¹
 Knowledge of result of cause is the analytical knowledge of *attha*.

- 9 Cause and effect
"Tesaṃ dhammānaṃ paññāya atthaṃ na upaparikkhanti"¹²
They do not examine with wisdom the cause and effect of those things.
- 10 'Business or work that is to be done' (*kiicca*)
"Tameva atthaṃ sādhukaṃ manasi kareyyātha"¹³
You should bear well in mind this business only.
- 11 'Accomplishment of what is to be done' (*nippatti*),
"Atthāya me bhavissati"¹⁴
This will be my accomplishment.
- 12 Matter
"Ucchaige maṃ nisīdetvā, pitā atthānusāsati"¹⁵,
Having raised me up and placed me on his knee,
father advised me on the matter.
- 13 Position or rank (*hānantara*),
"So me attho anuppatto"¹⁶
I have reached that position.
- 14 Incident, as in
"Bhagavato etamatthaṃ ārocesi"¹⁷
He informed the Blessed One of the incident.
- 15 Principle,
"Atha kho Bhagavā etamattha viditvā tāyaṃ velāyaṃ imaṃ udānaṃ
udānesi"¹⁸
Having understood the principle, the Blessed One 'breathed forth this
solemnutterance' to the multitude.
- 16 Practice,
"Karaṇīyamatthakusalena..."¹⁹
What ought to be practised by one who is skilled in the matter.
- 17 *Nibbāna* "Parinibbuto puggalo atthatthamhi natthatthamhīti?"²⁰ Is a
person who has attained the final release in the state of *Nibbāna* or not in
the state of *Nibbāna*?

Of these meanings and illustrations, there are some which may be ambiguous and require a little more clarification. The meaning number (3) '*payojana*' is explained as '*phala*' which, here, certainly does not mean 'result or effect' as elsewhere. If '*phala*'

here means 'result or effect', the dictionary's compilers would not repeat it as the meaning of number (8) '*phala*'. According to the *Petavatthu-aṭṭhakathā*, '*phala*' is also synonymous with '*ānisamsa*'²¹, 'something advantageous'. This meaning then expresses itself directly in the application of '*attha*' in the example. The example can be directly translated thus 'As far as there is something advantageous to be done with gold coins'. This is perhaps why the *Suttanipāta-aṭṭhakathā* quotes the very example to explain '*attha*' in the sense of 'something (advantageous) to do' (*kiccatthe*).²² Thus, '*attha*', in the sense of '*payojana*', can mean both 'need' and 'something advantageous' the former is taken by indirect meaning, while the latter by direct meaning.

In number (7), the term '*kāra*' has a wide range of meaning such as 'practical reason' 'fact', and 'purpose'. Therefore, getting a precise meaning for '*attha*' in the sense of '*kāra*' virtually depends on the Pāli contexts as in the illustrations shown above. '*Attha*' is formed by adding the noun-forming suffix 'ta' to the root √*asa*. When the vowel 'a' of √*asa* is dropped and the consonant 's' of √*asa* and 't' of 'ta' come together, the two consonants are changed into 'tt', hence the word '*attha*'. This is also a rule governing assimilation. Like the previous examples of *attha* the present '*attha*' has various meanings which are shown below.

- 1 Destruction (*vināsa*),
 "Tepi corassa Aṅgulimālassa hatthatthaṃ gacchanti",²³
 They indeed go to destroy the hand of Aṅgulimāla, the thief.
- 2 Disappearance,
 "Sasisse nibbute nāthe, atthamentamhi sāsane",²⁴
 When the Protector together with his disciples no longer exist, then the disappearance of the dispensation comes to be.
- 3 Extinction (*natthibhāva*),
 "Atthaṃ gacchanti āsavā",²⁵
 The extinction of cankers takes place.
- 4 Western mountain (*pacchimapabbata*),
 "Sūriye atthaṃ upagacchante",²⁶
 Literally means 'when the sun moves towards the western mountain' i.e. when the sun sets.

in the two important treatises, namely, the *Vibhaṅga* and the *Paṭisambhidāmagga*. Because the two treatises bear a somewhat more or less diversity in dealing with the subject-matter concerned, 'attha' will be defined by two approaches: One is from the *Vibhaṅga* and the other from the *Paṭisambhidāmagga*.

'Attha' in the *Vibhaṅga* is again elucidated by two methods: one is *Suttanta* (*Suttantabhājanīya*) and the other is *Abhidhamma* (*Abhidhammabhājanīya*). The first method explains 'attha' in conformity with five sections: (i) truth (*sacca*), (ii) cause (*hetu*), (iii) phenomena (*dhamma*), (iv) dependent origination (*paṭiccasamuppāda*) and (v) doctrine (*pariyatti*); whereas the latter explicates 'attha' in terms of ultimate reality such as consciousness (*citta*), mental concomitant (*cetasika*), etc., as usually seen in the *Abhidhamma* Texts.

According to the *Suttantabhājanīya*, 'attha', in the first section, refers to the noble truth of suffering (*dukkha*) and the noble truth of cessation of suffering (*dukkha-nirodha*). In the second section, 'attha' signifies the result produced by cause (*hetuphala*); and in the third section, its inference is with regard to the phenomena which are 'born, become, begotten, existent, fully existent and apparent' (*ye dhammā jātā bhūtā sañjātā nibbattā abhinibbattā, pātubhūtā*). In the fourth section, 'attha' stands for aging-and-death (*jarāmaraṇa*) and the cessation of aging-and-death (*jarāmaraṇa-nirodha*), the birth (*jāti*) and the cessation of birth (*jāti-nirodha*) and so on, up to the mental formation (*saṅkhāra*) and the cessation of mental formation (*saṅkhāra-nirodha*). And in the last section, 'attha' means the meaning of the Buddha's Word (*bhāsitaṣṣa attha*), which is divided into *Sutta* (discourse in prose), *Geyya* (discourse in prose and verse), and so on. All these significations will be made clear later on.

Unlike the *Vibhaṅga*, the *Paṭisambhidāmagga* describes 'attha' in a less varied but more functional way. Accordingly, 'attha' means 'functions' (*kiṅka*) of faculties (*indriyāni*), of powers (*balāni*), of enlightenment factors (*sambhojjaṅgā*), and of the noble path (*ariyo maggo*). Elsewhere, it is described as 'objective meaning'.

Therefore, 'attha' here refers to the five corresponding functions of the five faculties, the five corresponding functions of the five powers, the seven corresponding

functions of the seven enlightenment factors, and the eight corresponding functions of the eightfold noble path. The five corresponding functions of the five faculties are: 'determination' (*adhimokkhat̥ṭha*), 'exertion' (*paggahaṭṭha*), 'establishment' (*upaṭṭhānaṭṭha*), 'non-distraction' (*avikkhepaṭṭha*) and 'intuition' (*dassanaṭṭha*).

The five corresponding functions of the five powers are: 'unshakeability against diffidence' (*assaddhiye akampiyaṭṭha*), 'unshakeability against idleness' (*kosajje akampiyaṭṭha*), 'unshakeability against negligence' (*pamāde akampiyaṭṭha*), 'unshakeability against restlessness' (*uddhacce akampiyaṭṭha*) and 'unshakeability against ignorance' (*avijjāya akampiyaṭṭha*).

The seven corresponding functions of the seven enlightenment factors are: 'establishment' (*upahānaṭṭha*), 'inquiry' (*pavīcayaṭṭha*), 'exertion' (*paggahaṭṭha*), 'suffusion' (*pharaṇaṭṭha*), 'calmness' (*upasamaṭṭha*), 'non-distraction' (*avikkhepaṭṭha*) and 'carefulness' (*paṭisaṅkhāna*).

The eight corresponding functions of the eightfold noble path are: 'intuition' (*dassanaṭṭha*), 'application' (*abhiniropanaṭṭha*), 'taking up' (*pariggahaṭṭha*), 'origination' (*samuhānaṭṭha*), 'purity' (*vodānaṭṭha*), 'exertion' (*paggahaṭṭha*), 'establishment' (*upahānaṭṭha*) and 'non-distraction' (*avikkhepaṭṭha*).

In another place²⁷ in the same treatise, '*attha*' is explained as the five respective functions of the five aspects of realisation. The five aspects of realisation are: 'intuitive eye' (*cakkhu*), 'knowledge' (*nāṇa*), 'wisdom' (*paññā*), 'vision' (*vijjā*) and 'light' (*āloka*), which penetrate different phenomena such as 'the four noble truths' (*cattāri ariyasaccāni*), 'the four foundations of mindfulness' (*cattāro satipaṭṭhānā*), 'the four bases of psychic power' (*cattāro iddhipādā*), 'the arising' (*samudaya*) and 'the ceasing' (*nirodha*). These five aspects of realisation also penetrate the all-knowing knowledge (*sabbaññutañāṇa*) that completely knows: the direct knowledge (*abhiññā*), the four respective significance of the four noble truths, the aggregates-elements-bases (*khandha-dhātu-āyatana*), and the Buddha's fourteen types of knowledge (*cuddasa Buddhañāṇāni*). This mode of penetration into the all-knowing knowledge, however, is ascribed to the Buddha only, but not to his noble disciples. Thus, the five respective functions, which stand for '*attha*', of these five

aspects of realisation, are as follows: 'intuition' (*dassanaṭṭha*), 'knowing' (*ñāṭṭha*), 'understanding' (*pajānanaṭṭha*), 'penetration' (*paṭivedhaṭṭha*) and 'shining' (*obhāsaṭṭha*).

In brief, 'attha' found in the *Paṭisambhidāmagga* is noteworthy. It denotes different functions of different factors such as the five faculties, the five powers, etc. At first glance, one may assume that 'attha' explained here is totally different from the *Vibhaṅga* explanation. Yet, from the aspect of dependent arising, all these functions are the causal results arisen from their respective originating sources viz., the five faculties, the five powers and so forth. More specifically, these functions are conditionally produced or originated (*paccayasamuppanna*). Therefore, they are clearly included in the first of the fivefold meaning viz. 'yaṃkiñci paccayasamuppanna', as summarized in the *Vibhaṅga Atthakathā*.

Features of Paṭisambhidā

Atthapaṭisambhidā or the analytical knowledge of result, like other kinds of knowledge, bears certain characteristics of its own. One of its most apparent characteristics, as the term '*paṭisambhidā*' itself reveals, is the analytical or discriminating knowledge. Before making known these distinguishing qualities, it is very necessary, at first, to clearly focus on that knowledge.

Another aspect of the analytical knowledge of result is also noteworthy. The analytical knowledge of result arises in the four types of sense-sphere wholesome consciousness associated with knowledge (*kāmāvacarakusalato catūsu ñāṇasampayuttesu cittuppādesu*), in the four types of sense-sphere inoperative consciousness associated with knowledge (*kāmāvacarakīriyato catūsu ñāṇasampayuttesu cittuppādesu*), and in the four Paths and four Fruitions (*catūsu maggesu catūsu phalesu ca*). In other words, it is mundane as well as supra-mundane (*lokiyalokuttara*).

Alternatively, *atthapaṭisambhidā* arises in both trainees (*sekkha*) and non-trainees (*asekkha*). With regard to the training ground of trainees, it occurs in the four types of sense-sphere wholesome consciousness associated with knowledge, in the four

Paths and in the first three Fruitions. When a trainee views the result (*atthapaccavekkhaṇakāle*) taking the above-mentioned results as object, *atthapaṭisambhidā* appears in the four types of sense-sphere wholesome consciousness. On the other hand, at the time of the Paths and Fruitions (*maggaphalakāle*), *atthapaṭisambhidā* arises in those respective Paths and Fruitions taking *Nibbāna* as an object.

In the sphere of non-trainees, however, the analytical knowledge of result occurs in the four types of sense-sphere inoperative consciousness associated with knowledge and in the last Fruition of the recluse (*uparīma sāmaññaphala*) i.e. *Arahattaphala* or *Arahatta* Fruition. Like the trainee, when a non-trainee reviews the result making the above-mentioned results as object, *atthapaṭisambhidā* takes place in the four types of sense-sphere inoperative consciousness associated with knowledge. On the contrary, at the time of *Arahatta* fruition, it arises in the *Arahatta* fruition taking *Nibbāna* as an object.

Concerning the quality of the object *atthapaṭisambhidā* takes the inferior object (*parittārammaṇa*) when one reviews twenty-three types of resultant consciousness and eleven types of inoperative consciousness together with their respective associated mental concomitants, and whatever conditionally arisen, that pertain to sense-sphere. Similarly, it takes a lofty object (*mahaggatārammaṇa*) when one reviews nine resultant and nine inoperative consciousnesses together with their respectively associated mental concomitants pertaining to fine-material and immaterial spheres. In the same way, it takes a boundless object (*appamāṇārammaṇa*) when one reviews the four supra-mundane fruitions and *Nibbāna*.

With reference to the time of the object, when one reviews the resultant phenomena, the inoperative phenomena and whatever conditionally arisen, belonging to the past, future and present, *atthapaṭisambhidā* is said to take past, future and present objects respectively. But, when one reviews the supra-mundane *Nibbāna*, it is not said to have such an object whether past, present or future.

In connection with the locality of the object, when one reviews internal resultant and

inoperative phenomena and whatever conditionally arisen, *atthapaṭisambhidā* is said to have internal object (*ajjhattārammaṇa*). However, when one reviews those phenomena externally and internally-and-externally, it is said to have external (*bahiddhāramma*) and internal-and-external objects (*ajjhatabahiddhārammaṇa*) respectively.

Abbreviations

A	<i>Aṅguttara-nikāya</i>
Abhp	<i>Abhidharmapradīpikā</i>
Ap	<i>Apadāna</i>
ApA	<i>Apadāna-aṭṭhakathā</i>
D	<i>Dīgha-nikāya</i>
DA	<i>Dīgha-nikāya-aṭṭhakathā</i>
Dhp	<i>Dhammapada</i>
J	<i>Jātaka</i>
Khp	<i>Khuddakapāṭha</i>
Kv	<i>Kathāvatthu</i>
M	<i>Majjhima-nikāya</i>
Psm	<i>Paṭisambhidāmagga</i>
Pv	<i>Petavatthu</i>
PvA	<i>Petavatthu-aṭṭhakathā</i>
S	<i>Samyutta-nikāya</i>
SnA	<i>Suttanipāta</i>
U	<i>Udāna</i>
V	<i>Vinaya Piṭaka</i>
Vbh	<i>Vibhaṅga</i>